

Plato's Republic

Important introductory issues in Socrates/Plato and the program of education in the Republic:

1. Socrates was concerned about the clear and distinct definitions of terms and concepts such as "justice," "virtue," "piety," and "courage."
2. He defended the thesis that "virtue is knowledge." In other words, to know the good is to do the good. This raises the following questions, however:

Can virtue really be taught, and if so, how? By imparting information, but drawing out knowledge of virtue that is inborn?

How is it possible for persons who have been taught and know the good to act contrary to the principles they have learned?

3. He (Socrates/Plato) held that knowledge is innate or inborn, and that it must not therefore be imparted (since it is already there in the mind of the knower), but rather it must be drawn out, prompted, recalled, or elicited.

This is especially clear in Plato's dialogue the *Meno*, where Socrates is able to draw out of an untaught, common slave boy named Meno the basic truths of Euclidian geometry which he is shown to already possess innately.

N.B.: the word *educare* from which we get our word "educate" etymologically means *e* - out, *ducere* - to lead, draw, or bring, hence to draw out or bring forth.

N.B.: this question of the inborn nature of truth will come to the forefront in the works by Augustine, *The Teacher (De Magistro)*, and Aquinas, *Concerning the Teacher*, where the role of teaching is discussed, esp. whether (1) it is necessary, and if so (2) by eliciting knowledge, or (3) imparting knowledge, or (4) both.

4. Socrates/Plato also employ what is called the "Socratic Method," that is, a method of teaching that employs the intensive question and answer process that attempts to accomplish at least the following things:

Negatively, using questions and proffered answers to demonstrate to the student that his/her answers are unclear, contradictory, and in fact wrong,

thereby prompting the positive purpose of clarification, consistency, and correctness.

Positively, to employ questions to draw forth answers and understandings that are innately buried in the un/subconscious mind of the learner, so that he/she comes into an awareness of what he/she already knows.

How effective is the socratic method of teaching and to what extent is it applicable to other fields outside of philosophy, say in chemistry or history?

5. Plato's philosophy of education in the *Republic* reflects his overall worldview (metaphysics, epistemology, ethics, politics, etc.), it denigrates vocational education (typical of the Greeks, including Aristotle), creates an intellectual and moral elite (leading to oligarchy), separates knowledge from action (contemplation is the key), and is based on a considerable amount of censorship (only those things that contribute to the positive edification of the soul in service to the state are permitted).

6. Plato's philosophy of education is set forth in service to the construction of the good (*agathonapolis*) or beautiful city (*kallipolis*). A good and beautiful city is one that would be characterized by virtue where men would fight for honor and where the welfare of the soul (including its immortality) and the practice of philosophy to know the truth were promoted.

7. However, the appetites of men and women are so strong that they lead to war in the individual, in the city, in the nation, and between countries. Hence, to keep the peace and prevent war from destroying the city, an order of **guardian-police** are needed to constrain both internal and external enemies.

N.B. It is interesting that one historic purpose for classical liberal education was self-governance (i.e., self-control and personal discipline). If the sum-total of a citizenry was so educated and self-controlled, the state could flourish in freedom. On the other hand, a lack of liberal education and thus self-governance leads to the need for state-governance to control wayward behavior, even to the point of totalitarianism. Hence, the immensely valuable role of the liberal education of citizens for the sake of establishing a free and civil society.

8. Plato's therefore presents a program of education for the guardians of his good and beautiful city. This is one of the primary concerns of the *Republic*: to set forth a system of the education of the guardians to develop them, and prepare them for their civil service. It comes down to us as one of the greatest proposals on education in all Western history, and has prompted enormous reflection on the meaning of education in human life in terms of its purposes, curriculum, and methods of instruction.

The concentration is the **moral education** of the guardians to insure that would not become intemperate and unjust cowards.

The appropriate education for guardians focused first of all on **music and poetry** and then **physical education**.

Music and poetry (*mousike*): poetry, stories, and music proper

Physical education (*Gymnastike*): dance, training in warfare, physical fitness

At the center of the discussion is the issue of **narrative** or the kind of stories that these guardians should and should not hear to foster appropriate qualities in these future rulers (hence, the issue of censorship is immediately brought to the forefront for consideration).

Book 2

9. The concern of Socrates and Glaucon is the character and quality of the guardians, esp. in the development of two things: **spiritedness** (savagery and harshness) and **gentleness**. But it seems impossible to combine such antithetical qualities in one and the same guardian. They believe, however, there are natures that combine such opposite characteristics, such as pedigreed dogs.

This reminds us of whether or not it is possible to combine in one and the same Christian scholar the characteristics of ***pietas et doctrina!*** Of the guardian, Socrates says the following:

“If someone lacks either gentleness of spirit, he can’t be a good guardian. Yet it seems impossible to combine them. It follows that a good guardian cannot exist.” (375)

Based on this quote, we may ask if it is possible for Christian scholars to exist who possess both *pietas et doctrina*, piety and learning. Hence, the quote adapted to get this point across:

“If someone lacks either piety or learning, he/she can’t be a good Christian scholar. Yet it seems virtually impossible to combine them (at least in contemporary evangelicalism!). Hence, it follows that a good Christian scholar cannot exist!”

10. The qualities needed in a guardian are philosophy, spirit, speed, and strength, and philosophy here means intellectual curiosity, that is, wanting to know things for their own sakes without ulterior motives. But the question is: how to bring him up and educate him? Hence, the discussion turns to a description in theory of how to educate the guardians. 376

11. The answer is: **physical training** for the body, and **music and poetry** for the soul. However, it's music and poetry **first**, then physical training (there is an order to the learning process; why does Socrates advocate the shaping of the soul first, then the body?).

Because he says that the beginning of any process is most important, especially anything young and tender, for at that time it is most malleable and takes on any pattern one wishes to impress on it. See also Plato's *Laws*, and the following quote:

The first shoot of any plant, if it makes a good start towards the attainment of its own excellence has the greatest effect on its maturity." *Laws VI*, 165.

What kind of warrior one will be will turn upon what kind of person one is, and the development of personhood is rooted in the liberal education fostered by music and poetry. And stories were crucial, especially in poetic education.

12. However, some stories are true, but some false. Hence, there must be selection of fine or beautiful stories and the rejection of the opposite, for just any old stories told by just anyone could contain harmful beliefs that become very harmful to the shaping of the soul. Hence, we have two profound issues in education raised right here: **CURRICULUM** (choice of texts) and **CENSORSHIP** (elimination of texts).

13. Mothers and nurses will shape the soul of their children more with their stories than they shape their bodies by handling them (actually, handling a child's body physically with loving caresses and touches also shapes the soul. See Ashley Montagu's, *Touching*).

14. The "major" stories of Homer and Hesiod ought not be told because of their falsehood, because they depict the gods as heroes, and induce children to imitate their despicable actions, which is perceived as doing nothing wrong. Here the role of **ROLE MODELS** (in the form of gods) and the concept of **IMITATION** is on display. Education in many ways is looking for examples to imitate. 378

Also, the young can't distinguish between allegorical from real stories, and the opinions they absorb at that age are hard to erase and apt to become unalterable. Hence, any story that fosters hate is to be banned, for it is impious to hate a fellow citizen.

15. There are several **rules or principles** that poets and storytellers must conform to if their stories are to be told in the *Republic*:

a. that a god isn't the cause of all things, but only of the good ones. 380c

b. that the gods are not sorcerers who change themselves nor do they mislead us by falsehood in words or deeds. 383a

16. Having completed his discussion about the content of stories about the gods and heroes that the guardians should hear and not hear, Plato turns to the content of **stories about human beings** (from theology to anthropology), but his discussion is postponed until book 10. Instead, he speaks of the appropriate style, mode, and rhythm for lyric odes and songs, makes remarks about all the arts, speaks of the Greek practice of *pedagogy*, and physical training.

Book 3

17. What stories ought to be allowed in the *Republic*? Not stories that induce fear of death; hence, the issue of **censorship**: we must undertake to set controls over those who tell fables, to encourage them to speak well of the other world for the sake of those who are intended to be warlike. They must not be taught to fear death, but only dishonor. Hence certain passages from Homer must be removed. Specifically, the following things must not be discussed:

- a. stories that produce a fear of death and Hades
- b. frightening and dreadful names for the underworld
- c. lamentations and pitiful speeches of famous men
- d. those who are lovers of laughter and overcome by it. 386-88

18. How ought **falsehood** be used in the *Republic*? Falsehood must be used only by professionals, that is, the rulers! Just as medicine can only be used rightly by doctors, only the rulers of the state who know what is best have the right to lie. 389
Machiavelli; Wag the Dog; Washington, D. C.

19. Also, in order to produce **moderation**, certain things must not be discussed as well, such as stories about the loss of sexual self control among the gods. 389-90

20. To impart **endurance**, certain things should be discussed; also, to prevent guardians from becoming money lovers and bribable, certain things should not be discussed 390-1

21. How the stories are **harmful** to people who hear them for two reasons:

- a. They will excuse themselves when they themselves are bad if they are persuaded that the gods also do such things.
- b. These stories must be stopped lest they produce in youth a strong inclination to do bad things. 391-2

22. Having completed what kind of **THEOLOGICAL STORIES** can and can't be told, Socrates proceeds to discuss what kind of **ANTHROPOLOGICAL STORIES** can

and can't be told. Most of these stories about people are bad, and shouldn't be told. This discussion must be postponed until it is clear what justice really is. Hence, Socrates moves on to talk about the style of stories.

23. Having discussed the matter of the **content** of stories, Socrates goes on to speak of **how** they are to be told; hence, two issues are under consideration: 392

- a. **What** ought to be said. What narratives are permissible.
- b. **How** the narratives ought to be told, the mode of saying them.

24. When it comes to **poetry and imitation** (= to make oneself like someone else in voice or appearance is to imitate the person one makes oneself like), there are three types:

- a. Poetry that is simple narration without imitation (3rd person)
- b. Poetry that is imitation by the narrator of other characters in the story; act out or imitate or represent what happens in a story (use 1st person)
- c. Poetry that contains both a. and c. 394

25. Thus, the question becomes: Ought the guardians be apt imitators or not? The answer is: NO! Why?

- a. Since guardians, like others in the *Republic*, can really do only one thing and do it well, and since they have a **single vocation** or calling, they ought not to try to imitate other things nor should they by doing so violate their single calling. 395a
- b. Also, **people become like what they imitate**; hence, guardians should not imitate women, slaves, bad men, madmen, smiths or craftsmen; he may only imitate a good man, period. 395-6.

26. Having discussed poetry, what and how it is to be said, Plato moves on to MUSIC. 398c.

27. The three parts of music are: words, harmonic mode, and rhythm. Words as in poetry must meet the standards already set down, and since mode and rhythm must fit the words, only certain modes and rhythms are acceptable which are these:

- a. Mode of the courageous person suffering hardship heroically in battle
- b. Mode of the voluntary person serving others in self control and moderation. 399a
- c. Modes of dirges, lamentations, drinking parties, etc. are out

d. Also certain musical instruments are out as well, especially polyphony and multistringed instruments, as well as the flute; the lyre, cithara, and pipe are acceptable.

28. Next is the regulation of meter or rhythm: the acceptable are those that lead to an ordered and courageous life, not metrical feet that encourage slavishness, insolence, madness, and other vices. Indeed, grace and gracelessness follows good and bad rhythm respectively. 400a-d.

29. Thus, there is an order here: rhythm and mode conform to the words, and the content of the words conform to the content of the musician's soul/character in a cause/effect relation:

SIMPLICITY OF SOUL/CHARACTER □WORDS□MODE/RHYTHM 400d-e

30. Should practitioners of every other craft as well as poets be censored? Yes, both and the reason is that guardians should be exposed to fair sights and sounds from their youth up else they become corrupt:

“We would not have our guardians grow up amid images of moral deformity, as in some noxious pasture, and there browse and feed upon many a baneful herb and flower day by day, little by little, until they silently gather a festering mass of corruption in their own soul. Let our artists rather be those who are gifted to discern the true nature of the beautiful and graceful; then will our youth dwell in a land of health, amid fair sights and sounds, and receive the good in everything; and beauty, the effluence of fair works, shall flow into the eye and ear, like a health-giving breeze from a purer region, and insensibly draw the soul from earliest years into likeness and sympathy with the beauty of reason” 410a-b-c

And this is why education in music and poetry is most important, because it has to do with the making of persons in accordance with objective ideals:

Aren't these the reasons, Glaucon, that education in music and poetry is most important?

First, because rhythm and harmony permeate the inner part of the soul more than anything else, affecting it most strongly and bringing it grace, so that if someone is properly educated in music and poetry, it makes him graceful, but if not, then the opposite.

Second, because anyone who has been properly educated in music and poetry will sense it acutely when something has

been omitted from a thing and when it hasn't been finely crafted [by man] or finely made by nature.

And since he has the right distastes, he'll praise fine things, be pleased by them, receive them into his soul, and, being nurtured by them, become fine and good.

He'll rightly object to what is shameful, hating it while he's still young and unable to grasp the reason, but, having been educated in this way, he will welcome the reason when it comes and recognize it because of its kinship with himself. 401e-402a (Grube/Reve)

Hence, education in music and poetry is most important for two reasons leading to three consequences:

- (1) it makes a student graceful (or not);
- (2) such gracefulness provides the criterion of discernment (objective taste rooted in an objective reality).

Then on the basis of the criterion, there will result three consequences. The student will possess:

- (a.) the power of objective discernment, praising and receiving fine things, leading to transformation,
- (b.) have the ability to reject what is shameful, even as an unformed youth, avoiding corruption, and
- (c.) when fully rational, will more readily receive these things consciously because they have already become part of him

Hence, 1 and 2 are imparted at an early age at an intuitive level; 3 involves conscious awareness and rational reception of the things inculcated early on and embrace intuitively.

Here is the same quote from another translation with the same analysis in numbers and letters:

And therefore, I said, Glaucon, musical training is a more potent instrument than any other, (1) because rhythm and harmony find their way into the inward places of the soul, on which they mightily fasten, imparting grace, and making the soul of him who is rightly educated graceful, or of him who is ill-educated ungraceful; (2) and also because he who has received this true education of the inner being will most shrewdly perceive omissions or faults

in art and nature, (a) and with a true taste, while he praises and rejoices over and receives into his soul the good, and becomes noble and good, (b) he will justly blame and hate the bad, now in the days of his youth, even before he is able to know the reason why; (c) and when reason comes he will recognize and salute the friend with whom his education has made him long familiar (Jowett).

This is at the heart of Greek paideia: the impartation of education and culture and the becoming of a well-formed, fully human person according to the objective IDEAL.

30. Now Socrates/Plato goes on to a **most important illustration comparing the recognition of letters of the alphabet with objective ideals and virtues**: just as we in reading must know how to recognize letters, whether large or small in themselves or reflected in things if we are to read, so also if we are to be truly educated, we must be able to recognize the ultimate ideals, the forms, the universals that constitute the nature of things, especially the virtues of moderation, courage, frankness, highmindedness, and the like, as well as their opposites.

For just as we must recognize letters themselves and their reflections in things if we are to read, so we must be able to see and detect these ideals “in the things in which they are, both themselves and their images, and not disregard them, whether written in small or large things (big or little events in life), for this is the heart of education.

This is the subject of C. S. Lewis’s book, *The Abolition of Man*.

31. Then Socrates/Plato go on to discuss the relation of a beautiful character to a beautiful, well-trained, and disciplined body: physical training 403d. They ought to avoid a variety of things unbecoming a guardian, including drunkenness, sweet deserts, Corinthian girlfriends, Attic pastries, etc. Indeed, just as simplicity in music and poetry makes for moderation of soul, so also simplicity in physical life makes for bodily health. And if there is licentiousness and disease, then law courts and hospitals increase, and those who practice such professions are prideful (“give themselves solemn airs”). 404e

It is a sign of a very bad and shameful education if in a city there is a great need for doctors and lawyers, not only by inferior people and craftsmen, but also by free people who have been allegedly educated. 405b

The poorer the education, the greater the need for doctors and lawyers!!!

32. What kind of individuals make the best doctors and judges? Regarding doctors, those who are weak in body, but pure in soul, for they don’t treat a diseased body with their body, but with their soul, and the soul can’t treat anything well if it is or has been bad. Regarding judges, they are to have a sound body and soul, for no soul

steeped in injustice can judge the injustice of others; he must be old having learned of injustice not from experience but from others.409ab

33. Thus, young people educated in music and poetry and in physical training rarely if ever will need doctors or lawyers, and will not, therefore, do any harm to their city's affairs. 410ab

34. What is the aim of education in music and poetry, and education in body? Both are done for the sake of the soul, for this reason. Lifelong physical training minus poetry and music hardens the soul; lifelong education in poetry and music minus physical training softens the soul. Hence, both are needed in balance for the sake of the soul.410de Lengthy discourse on the need for both education in music and poetry and also in the body.

It seems, then, that a god has given music and physical training to human beings not, except incidentally, for the body and the soul but for the spirited and wisdom-loving parts of the soul itself, in order that these might be in harmony with one another, each being stretched and relaxed to the appropriate degree {plug in pietas et doctrina here!}. 411e

35. Who are the rulers to be (and who should be ruled)? The rulers must be the best guardians, knowledgeable, capable, and caring for the city. Here is a very Augustinian point: one cares most for what one loves, and one loves something most when it results in personal benefit. Hence, they must choose those who so love the city, believing that its well being means their own well being. Hence, those must be chosen who do what is best for the city (even though their motive is egoistic).412cde. Those who would be rulers must also pass strenuous lifelong tests 414ab; plus, the god has put gold in some to rule, silver in the auxiliaries, and iron and bronze in craftsmen (the myth of the metals). Some people by divine design are made to rule.

Socrates thinks the people ought to believe in a grand lie that will make the classes content with their station and callings.

All citizens are brothers and made from the same stock, but some have gold, some silver, others iron and bronze in their veins and most will have children of the same, though class jumping is possible when children are born who have the kind of blood different from parents.415, abc.

13. How the guardians are to live; no private property; no dwelling or storehouse; common meals and live as in a camp, etc. 62

Book 7

1. The cave analogy in which the sun represents the GOOD.

2. The GOOD is the ultimate object of knowledge, the source of all that is bright and beautiful in the visible and invisible world; this form must be set before the eyes of the one who would be wise. 517abc

3. Those who discover the GOOD forsake human affairs and their souls are always pressing upwards, eager to spend time above; hence, the origin of Platonic otherworldliness! 517cd

4. What is the nature of education? Not to infuse knowledge into the mind of the ignorant. Education is the turning around of the instrument in the soul to face the GOOD, from the perishing world to the real world. The structure of educational revolutions is the symbolic turning of the soul to see the light, and this involves an art, the art of teaching, not to generate in a student the power of seeing which he already has, but since he is turned in the wrong direction, the teacher must right this defect and turn him in the right direction. The teacher's primary task is the motivation of revolution! 518bcde

Education isn't what some people declare it to be, namely, putting knowledge into souls that lack it, like putting sight into blind eyes.

[Rather] . . . the power to learn is in everyone's soul and that the instrument with which each learns is like an eye that cannot be turned around from darkness to light without turning the whole body. This instrument cannot be turned around from that which is coming into being [empirical world of becoming] without turning the whole soul until it is able to study that which is [rational world of being] and the brightest thing that is, namely, the one we call the good. . . .

Then education is the craft concerned with doing this very thing, this turning around, and with how the soul can most easily and effectively be made to do it. It isn't the craft of putting sight into the soul. Education takes for granted that sight is there but that it isn't turned the right way or looking where it ought to look, and it tries to redirect it appropriately. 518bcd

[Education is] turning a soul from a day that is a kind of night to the true day—the ascent to what is, which we say is true philosophy (521c).

7. Why the uneducated and the educated cannot rule the state: the former because they have no telos, end or aim, the latter because of their arrogance. 519ab. Hence, the need for the enlightened who cannot remain in the upper world but must return for the common good. 519c

9. Education of the rulers is for the common good, and it will be for the sake of substance, not the shadows as regular rulers think who fight among themselves for shadows, etc. Yet when the true rulers are least eager to rule, they will govern the best and in the least factious manner. Those who govern least govern best.

Philosopher kings will rule differently than their “earthly” counter parts; their knowledge of the truth will result in a different kind of rule. If rulers rule for glory and happiness and prestige, then strife results; if they have their happiness already in the GOOD, they will rule far better, for they will not hunger after private advantages. Only the life of true philosophy and transcendence condemns state offices. “THE TASK OF GOVERNMENT MUST BE UNDERTAKEN BY PERSONS NOT ENAMoured OF IT.” 521ab

11. How do these rulers arise? The road is true philosophy. Which sciences possess the power to prepare them? Which sciences draw the soul from the fleeting to the real? Gymnastic is engaged on the changeable and perishing. Music does not possess the advantages needed. The useful arts are degrading. Are there any other sciences other than these that will accomplish the purpose of the education of the rulers? 521e;522ab

16. **NUMBER AND CALCULATION** because it leads to reflection. It is one of the sciences that leads to the upper world. 522c-523ab

Hence, the study of numbers must be legislated. Its students must by pure reason attain the contemplation of numbers, not for practical purposes but for war, and the conversion of the soul from the changeable to the true and the real and for knowledge.

The study of number obliges the mind to employ pure intelligence in pursuit of pure truth; those who study number are naturally quick at all sciences, and those who are slow who study numbers improve dramatically. 525ab

19. **GEOMETRY** is the next subject; it is necessary for warfare, and it facilitates contemplation of the good. It must be pursued for what eternally exists; it draws the soul to the truth and must be studied. 526cde...

20. **ASTRONOMY** benefits the agriculturalist, navigator, and general. It leads to the other world if pursued properly. Socrates proposes a new system for its study to accomplish its transcendent function in leading to the eternal world. 527d-528

21. See mutual relations and associations of things/ Weltanschauung as a great work; such knowledge is the prelude not the actual hymn 531d

I take it that all the subjects we've mentioned brings out their association and relationship with one another and draws conclusions about their kinship, it does contribute something to our goal.

To form a unified vision of their kinship both with one another and with the nature of that which is.537c

cave illustration applied

22. Proceed to the hymn itself which is dialectic and an investigation of its character, parts, and methods; the FACULTY OF DIALECTIC ALONE CAN REVEAL THE TRUTH TO ONE WHO IS MASTER OF THESE SCIENCES 533ab **DIALECTIC** is explained as that science which carries hypotheses back to its first principles, etc. 533cd

23. Four levels of knowledge: bottom two are opinion; top two are intelligence: Knowledge, Thought, Belief, Imaging 534a

24. Description of the students who would pursue these studies. What is the description of a legitimate student, rather than an illegitimate one: 535abcde

- Steady
- Manful
- Comely
- Noble
- Piercing eye
- Learn with ease
- Good memory
- Dauntless demeanor
- Love of work
- Talents of the highest order 103
- Listening 104
- Inquiring
- Temperance
- Fortitude
- Loftiness of mind
- Severe discipline
- YOUNG! 104
- Not compulsory learner, for no study pursued under compulsion remains in the memory 105
- Remarkable self possession
- At age 20
- Must be able to survey a subject as a whole
- At age 30. 105
- Possible insubordination of the dialectician when disabused of reifications, yet have fallen short of eternal truth. 106-7
- Internship of 15 years 108
- Rules at 50
- Women too 108

Aristotle, Nichomachian Ethics

1. Every action aims at some good; the good is that at which all things aim. 111
2. There is some end of the things we do which we desire for its own sake; everything is not chosen for the sake of something else; that which is chosen for its own sake is the GOOD, the CHIEF GOOD. Will not knowledge of it have a great influence on life? It will be like the target for the archer. What is it? 111
3. We will strive for as much clarity and certainty as the subject matter allows; precision is not the same for all subjects. In ethics, can only indicate the truth and in outline; such is the attitude of the educated man as the subject matter permits 111
4. STUDENT: A young man is not a good student of lectures on political science because of his inexperience and his passions, and the end of his education is not knowledge, but action. 112
5. On the other hand, those who act in accord with a rational principle knowledge of such political matters will be of great benefit. 112
6. There are incomplete and complete ends; incomplete are pursued for their own sake the sake of something else. The complete end only for itself and not for something else. This complete end is happiness 112
7. Happiness is chosen for itself and not for something else; all other things are chosen for it. Happiness is the complete and self sufficient end of all action 112
8. We need a clearer account of happiness and it begins by discerning the function of man as all other things have functions 112
9. The human good/happiness turns out to be the activity of the soul in accordance with excellence in a complete life, for one swallow does not make a summer, and a short time does not make a man blessed and happy. 113
10. The excellence sought is human excellence for the good sought is human good and the happiness human happiness; and re. excellence is of the soul, into the body. 113.
11. Soul has an irrational and rational parts; irrational is distributed and vegetative and causes nutrition and growth, 113; the irrational part of the soul is of two parts:
Vegetative part which does not share in reason.
The appetitive and desiring element share in reason. 114
12. Excellence is of two kinds:
Intellectual excellencies: practical wisdom

Moral excellencies: liberality and temperance 114

BOOK 2:

13. Intellectual excellence is from teaching; moral excellence is from habit. Moral excellence is not by nature; just as fire can fall or stones rise, so neither by nature nor contrary to nature do the excellencies arise in us; we are adapted by nature to receive them, and they are made perfect by habit. 114-5

14. In natural things we have them and then develop them; moral excellencies are not natura, but obtained by activity as in the arts. Men become shipbuilders by shipbuilding, flute players by flute playing, justice by doing just things (so too temperance and bravery) 115

15. States of excellence or the lack thereof arise out of activities; by our acts we become what we are, just, cowardly, brave, anger, appetites, etc. It makes a very big difference, all the difference, whether from our youth we form one kind of habit or another. 115

16. If actions determine what we are, we must examine the nature of actions. 115

17. Point #1: things are destroyed by defect or excess, too little or too much as in health so in morality. Yet, what is proportionate produces, increases, and preserves health and morality 116

18. Example of the golden mean: coward or rash or courage; pleasures, insensible or temperate 116

19. Are those who do just and temperate things already just and temperate, just as those who do grammatical or musical things already grammatical and musical? 116
The MENO question.

20. The agent must be in a certain condition when he does certain acts: 1. he must have knowledge (so Socrates); 2. he must choose the acts and for their own sakes (contra Socrates); 3. action must proceed from an unchangeable character.

21. As a condition of the possession of the excellencies, knowledge has little or no weight; the other conditions count for everything, namely, choice and character. 117.

22. The man who does justice and temperance as just and temperate men are truly just and temperate. Many think that if you have the theory you are just and temperate; not so any more than the patient has the doctors orders is healthy if he does not do them. Knowledge is not virtue. 117

23. Summary of excellence; a state concerned with choice lying in a mean determined by reason. 117

24. Clarifications of the mean issue: not every action admits of a mean.

25. Aristotle has stated his doctrine of the mean; but it is no easy task to be good, to find the mean. 117

26. Goodness is rare, laudable, and noble 118

27. We must dismiss utilitarian considerations in choosing the mean, especially pleasure 118.

BOOK VI

28. In addition to understanding the principle of the mean, choosing that which is intermediate on the basis of reason, we must also know what right reason is and what is the standard that fixes it. 118-9

29. The discussion now is on intellectual virtue and begin with remarks on the soul. The soul possesses two part: rational and irrational. Irrational is made of two parts--the vegetative and appetitive. The rational part has two parts:

Part one: by which we contemplate the kinds of things whose principles can't be otherwise; the calculative/deliberative

Part two: by which we contemplate variable things; the scientific

Question: what is the best state of each of these parts of the rational soul as the excellence of each in relation to its proper function. 119

30. There are three parts to the soul which control action and truth: sensation, thought and desire.

Sensation: originates in no action; animals have sensation but share in no action.

Thought: affirmation and negation are its functions.

Desire: pursuit and avoidance are its functions.

Hence, moral excellence as a state concerned with choice and choice is deliberate desire, therefore the reasoning must be true with regard to thought, and the desire right if the choice is to be good; desire must pursue what thought asserts. 119

31. What has been describe in 30 is the practical intellect; the intellect which is contemplative is not practical or productive, but only concerned with the true and false. 119

32. Here is the formula: the origin of action is choice and choice stems from desire and reason with a view to an end. Choice cannot exist with out thought or intellect or without a moral state (desire). All 3 go together: choice/reason/desire. Intellect and character and good or bad action. Intellect itself moves nothing CONTRA SOCRATES only intellect that aims at an end (motivated by desire) and is practical 119-20.

33. Who has practical wisdom?

Those who deliberate well about what is good and expedient for himself, not about specific things, but about the things that lead to the good life in general. The man capable of deliberating has practical wisdom. 120

Deliberation is not about things that cannot be otherwise or about things impossible to do. 120

Practical wisdom is not knowledge or art:

Not knowledge because that which can be done is capable of being otherwise

Not art because action and making are different kinds of things. 120

Making has an end other than itself; doing or acting is an end in itself. 120

34. Practical wisdom is concerned with human things and things about which it is impossible to deliberate; practical wisdom is not concerned aboiut universals only, but about particulars.

35. While young men may be geometricians and mathematicians, a young man of practical wisdom can't be found; why? Because it is concerned with particulars, and these come from experience and this is what the young man lacks. 120-1

36. The function of a man is achieved only in accord with practical wisdom and moral excellence; excellence makes the aim right and practical wisdom the things leading to the right aim. 121

37. Those who do just things are not necessarily just, for they may do them unwillingly or out of ignorance, etc. To be good, one must be in a good state as a result of choice and for the sake of the act themselves 121

38. The faculty of cleverness also comes in which applies to good and villains. 121

BOOK VII

39. What kind of belief is possessed by the one who behaves incontinently? Aristotle here presents the problem raised by Socrates: is to know the good to do the good? 121-2.

40. Perhaps it is against true opinion and not knowledge that we act wickedly. Perhaps it is because of weak conviction that they act wickedly.

When a man does what he should not, but has the knowledge but is not exercising it. This does not seem strange.

When a man does what he should not, and is exercising his knowledge, this seems strange. 122

41. There are two kinds of propositions, universal and particular, and a man may have universal propositions and knowledge, but not the particular, and therefore not act rightly because he only knows the universal 122

42.

Edwin Hatch, The Influence of Greek Ideas on Education

1. To understand early Christianity, must understand its environment 25
2. Greek world of 2nd and 3rd centuries was an educated world. 25
3. The educated world of the Greeks the product of the past five centuries 26
4. Sophos which originally had to do with mechanical skills came to refer to the one who was shrewd with practical wisdom and knew the thoughts and sayings of the ancients 26
5. Greece could accept the loss of political power because she still retained supremacy in the domain of letters. 26
6. Greek interest in letters reflected in their love of speech, and a literary instinct came about, stressing the knowledge of the literature of the past and a cultivation of speech which has been a mark of education ever since 27
7. Hatch is concerned with two things: the form and mass or extent of Greek education 27
8. Complexity of Greek education. Ours comes from theirs, and we emphasize literature because they did and its two main elements were Grammar and Rhetoric 27-8
9. Grammar = literature, reading and writing in three divisions:
 1. Technical = diction
 2. Historical = antiquities of an author
 3. Exegetical = explanation of author's meaning 29-30
10. Subject matter of the grammar = poets who were read for literary and moral value (like we read the Bible). 30
11. Rhetoric, the study of literature by the study of literary expression and quasi-forensic argument, taught by precept, example, and practice:

Precepts led to handbooks
Example led to lectures
Practice led to an institution 31
12. Student's tasks = memory, recitation, comments, compositions, extemporaneous speaking! 31
13. Also in addition to grammar and rhetoric there was philosophy 32

Learned to argue and use logic
Learn technical terms and history of philosophy

14. Philosophy degenerated into literature and to study it as such was a distortion
33-4

15. Two kinds of education: Divine and human 34-5

Divine: education, manly, highminded,

Human: mean, weak, dangerous, deceitful, literary

16. The extent of education of the Greeks 35ff:

Its general diffusion and the hold it had on people

Literary evidence and modes of obtaining education 35

Description of university life (that you don't get out of your habits and or make moral progress); lectures attended against their will, and don't listen, but minds wander (grt quote!) 36-7

Teaching a recognized and lucrative position 37

Received endowments 38

Received immunities from state 39

Place of professors in social life in high regard 40

Description of the degenerate philosopher who is a hypocrite (excellent!) 42

The survival of greek education til today shows its hold 42

Two features of this education and its influence today:

1. Place of literature in contemporary education 43

2. Technical terms still used today 43ff

a. Professor: to promise

b. Lecturing: reader

c. Chair: teacher's office

d. Faculty: from grk dunamis = latin facultas = ability, power, capacity

e. Academic designations: philosopher, sophists, grammarian, rhetorician

f. Right and qualifications to teach

17. Five elements in Greek Education:

1. Knowledge of literature
2. Cultivation of literary expression
3. Rules of argument
4. Widely diffused
5. Great hold on society⁴⁸

18. It comes into contact with Christianity and is modified, reformed, elevated. Yet Christianity gets much from this tradition ⁴⁹

Greek education in the second century had created a "certain habit of mind" and when Christianity came into contact with that habit of mind, it modified, reformed, elevated the ideas which it contained and the motives which stimulated it to action.

At the same time, Christianity was modified by this Greek habit of mind as well, giving christianity something of its own Greek form.